**DRAFT Incline Village/Crystal Bay**  **Citizen Advisory Board**

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Incline Village/Crystal Bay Citizen Advisory Board held on July 5, 2023, at 5:30 p.m. at 845 Alder Ave., Incline Village, Nevada 89451

1. **CALL TO ORDER/ DETERMINATION OF QUORUM - Denise Davis, Roxanna Dunn, Kevin Lyons, Chris Wood, Diane Becker,** **Carla Werner.**
2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE** Roxanna Dunn led the pledge.
3. **ELECTION OF THE INCLINE VILLAGE/CRYSTAL BAY CITIZEN ADVISORY BOARD CHAIR –** Members of the IVCB CAB will elect a Chair to serve July 2023 to June 2024 term.  **(Action-Item)**

The speaker asked if anyone else wanted to make nominations.

Chris Wood - A motion was made for Diane Becker to be the chair for the upcoming year.

The motion is carried and the meeting will continue. Unanimous.

1. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT –** Limited to no more than three (3) minutes. Anyone may speak pertaining to any matter either on or off the agenda. Please raise your hand on your computer and then you will be called one by one. Comments are to be addressed to the Board as a whole. Additionally, during action items public comment will be heard on that particular item before action is taken.

Caroline Usinger – I pick up a lot of trash around the area. Waste management has stickers to use so you do not have to find a place to put the trash when you clean it up around the neighborhood.

MaryBeth Abdow – Ditches are everywhere in Tahoe. The pavers that are in the ditches break up. They have a planned obsolescence of about 4 years. The Lower Wood Creek issue. They are planning on using more of these cells in the project.

Claire Novac – Team leader for United for Action. We focus on our neighbor's needs like clothing and shelter. We have been working for our unsheltered neighbors. In 2021, a housing needs study was conducted, which led to the formation of a partnership consisting of leaders from various sectors advocating for workforce housing solutions in the Tahoe area of Washoe County.

1. **ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM COMMISSIONER HILL – (Non-Action Item)**

Commissioner Hill provided updates on the Washoe-Tahoe Housing Partnership Roadmap and introduced Carla Warner as an alternate on the CAB. On July 11th, the Washoe County Commission will accept the Washoe-Tahoe Housing Partnership Roadmap.

1. **(Non-Action Item)**

Diane Becker – Inquired about the issue of cannabis consumption lounges.

Answer - The issue of cannabis consumption land use will be discussed at the Board of County Commissioners meeting on July 11th.

Caroline Usinger – TRPA Speaker did not speak into the microphone.

Answer - According to the newspaper, a developer requested the Washoe County Commission to consider Special Area District 1, which includes Tahoe Boulevard and part of the 947 Tahoe development. The County Commission approved the request after working with staff. As part of the 947 development, four workforce housing units were mandated, which is considered a success. This requirement was established by TRPA, and the county is exploring the possibility of participating in the enforcement of deed restrictions, as TRPA lacks the authority to do so.

Hellen Neff – Unintelligible.

Answer - Commissioner Clark voted against the denial and requested to reconsider it for board rules.

Jack Dalton – Has problems with 947, short-term rentals, housing and the impact of short-term rentals on affordable housing and the need for more workforce housing. During the meeting, the roadmap was mentioned as discussing the possibility of using ADUs to address the issue of workforce housing. When asked if they support ADUs in Incline Village, Commissioner Hill stated that they need to consider all options and that a separate policy adoption through the area plan would be required. The county does not support us.

Citizen - What other projects do you have in mind that will address affordable housing?

Chair – Cannabis lounge issue. Will we be able to address that on the 11th?

Answer - Yes, we will address the cannabis consumption lounges. According to our current short-term rental ordinance, only one short-term rental is allowed per property.

Kathy Jullian – Will the RFP, for the deed restriction enforcement work, have a component for public disclosure? A public database on deed restrictions? There are 95 of these properties. It is not a user-friendly system.

Answer from Hill. Yes, I understand that TRPA is looking into that today, not just in the future.

Doug Flaherty – The roadmap discusses ADUs as a possibility to alleviate workforce housing.

Answer from Hill – That would require a separate policy adoption through the area plan. It is important to look at all the options and look at all the possibilities.

Rhonda Tycer – We cannot hear the people who are talking in the room. We cannot hear people speaking in the room.

Chair – There are a lot of people with thoughts on STRs and ADUs. You talked about setting up a meeting time for small group discussions.

Answer from Hill – Absolutely. We will be setting up coffee hours to get some small group discussions.

1. **NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT HUB** – Staff to announce any upcoming neighborhood development meetings in the Incline Village/Crystal Bay area.  For more information click on HUB. **(Non-Action Item)**

There is a neighborhood meeting, the Lake Tahoe School District 1 on July 11th at 5:30.

1. **EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT IVCB EVACUATION PLAN –** Kelly Echeverria, Emergency Manager, Washoe County, will provide an update on an evacuation plan for the Incline Village/Crystal Bay area.  Captain Blaine Beard, Washoe County Sheriff’s Office and Chief Ryan Sommers, North Lake Tahoe Fire Protection District, will discuss the roles of their offices in the emergency evacuation plan and their perspectives on emergency evacuation from Incline Village/Crystal Bay. **(Non-Action Item)**

To address the concerns about evacuation, a video is being created with grant funding to set expectations and it will include information about decision-making, and who to expect at the door, and will be available in multiple languages with a sign language interpreter option. A full-scale exercise will be conducted in Incline on August 16th from 9 a.m. to 1.30 p.m., and it will be filmed.

This exercise is a wildfire scenario that will affect the Second Creek neighborhood. The team is responsible for identifying gaps in the plan, documenting them in an after-action review, creating an improvement plan, and updating the relevant portion of the plan.

Evacuation, Sheltering, and Mass Care Plan

The first phase of the plan update involved incorporating non-congregate sheltering, which was made possible by COVID funding and was identified as a gap in the plan. The plan is currently being updated for all of Washoe County, including Incline Village. The current step in the process is to identify locations for evacuation points, shelters, and bulk distribution. The current phase of the plan update will be completed within the next year, and there are three more stages after that, including building a training program. The plan was made available to the public by submitting it to the board, and it is expected to be submitted before the end of October. The public can provide input to our office at any time based on the current form. If necessary, the organization would collaborate with RTC (Regional Transportation Commission) to coordinate the response, even though it is not their jurisdiction, as they are one of the main partners in emergency situations. We have been including our partners in California in the joint California Nevada sheltering plan, and we appreciate their willingness to have difficult conversations and identify areas for improvement.

Chris Wood – Is the Plan being updated for Incline Village? How long will this take?

Answer – It is being done for all of Washoe County. Sometime in the next year, the first phase will be complete. There are three more stages. The first stage will be submitted before the end of October. You can submit public comments at any time to our office.

Diane Becker expressed concern about the lack of information regarding the modeling being done and the preparations being made for a forest fire, citing previous experiences with landslides and mudslides that required immediate evacuation of entire communities.

Answer - The plan was last tested in 2018 in a different area, and there was another exercise prior to that.

Diane Becker - The period from 2018 to 2023 is crucial because many new people have moved in, and there is a need for more knowledge and reassurance about the plan. The speaker expressed her concern that residents and visitors do not know what they are supposed to do in an evacuation, as past evacuations are not as relevant to current traffic issues, and the public feels uninformed and unclear as to what to do in an evacuation..

Answer – We are much different than Paradise California. We evacuate in stages, and we have these practice evacuations so that people will know what to do. We believe it is crucial to have this preparedness fair and why I am speaking with all of you and the board. I will continue to speak and work on rebuilding our preparedness program. Concerns were raised about the population figures and vehicle figures in the evacuation plan and requests for input from knowledgeable individuals. NDOT is involved in the planning process of this project. Trusting our partners in Incline who are engaged with this vendor to know and pull the numbers is really important. Arrange a meeting with the vendor to include everyone's input in the plan.

Roxanna Dunn – The speaker mentioned that they would send their three comments about the plan in an email with more details. Fire Season and Construction season are at the same time. The availability of only three exit corridors is a significant concern that needs to be addressed in the policies and procedures for the shutdown of construction and clearing of the road. The section on communication includes a lot of passive voice.

Kevin Lyons – What was the evacuation rate?

Answer - The speaker asked the Chief if the number of 17,000 people evacuated from South Lake Tahoe during the fire in 2021 was correct, and requested the Chief to provide the correct number if it was different.

Caroline Usinger – The tourists are not mentioned. Kings Beach and the roundabout are not mentioned. What if one of the cars runs out of gas? Nobody set the expectation that you need half a tank of gas just in case you need to sit in traffic to get out of there. Does each family take just one car? Are there people taking their boats?

Answer – There is a lot of fear. If the public can please address the board.

Jackie Chandler – We need a simple piece of paper with the four exits on it. It needs to be simple, like an evacuation plan in a school. The fourth evacuation of course is the lake. The math doesn’t matter. Just look for a way out. Don’t forget the lake.

Answer – I hope the fire department will address the lake as an option.

Jack Dalton – The lake is not considered an option for an exit. Due to the heat from the fire and the smoke.

Kathy Julian is concerned that this plan is not going to work. Why are we going to the rec center? I did some math. Everybody is going to leave at the same time. The speaker offered to email the math calculations to others if they were interested. The plan assumed a population of 8,669 people, which is less than both the 2020 and 2010 census counts.

Doug Flaherty – Do you consider the fact that you have not performed a worst-case scenario drill naive? Do you really believe that we are not the same as Caldor or Paradise is naive? It is. People cannot see in the smoke. Day and night smoke.

Pamela Zitnino - She shared her experience of encountering haphazardly parked cars and tourists on Highway 28. There is a complete disconnect between the people coming up for the day, and people who live here. We need to look at worst-case scenarios. We need to stop advertising this place to the whole world.

Beth Davidson – The code needs to deal with the whole town. If I see a fire, I am going to evacuate. Nobody can guarantee that the fire won't speed up. We need to get this plan in place.

Carole Black - Carole is concerned about the general situation, particularly regarding the math in the attached report, which they believe doesn't make sense. The speaker is concerned that the zoning changes and approved development may impact evacuation capabilities, and they feel that this issue needs to be viewed in a broader way by the whole county. The speaker is concerned that the zoning changes being considered do not take into account the broad thinking about how many people can be accommodated and the alternative transportation mechanisms that need to be put into place. According to the report attached to this meeting, routes crossing the Sierra Nevada mountain range are not considered viable, except from Reno and Sparks to Route 80.

Dana Gaughiur – Thank you Kelly for your time and efforts. This is a mathematical problem, a mathematical modeling problem. I echo the comments of people before me.

Alex Tsigdinos. – Inquired about the possibility of using a trail for evacuation in case of a fire incident and the extension of the trail to Spooner. The e-shore trail, currently three miles long from Incline to Sand Harbor, is being extended to Spooner, potentially reaching 50. Is there a possibility of expanding the trail to accommodate emergency situations, such as a fire incident, allowing for the evacuation of vehicles?

Aaron Vanderpool – Any plan should look at the future and all of the development taking place.

Sarah Schmitz – Is there an effort to look at this holistically? When we are talking about population density, we are not talking about our environment and wildlife. What is the cumulative impact?

Captain Blaine Beard –

Some of the comments directed at Kelly were disappointing. Their hard work, dedication, and professionalism are present with her and her team. Captain Beard to prepare and present crime trends and stats at the next CAB meeting.

Chief Sommers –

The Washoe County Sheriff's Office, North Lake Tahoe Fire Protection District, and all entities involved are 100% dedicated to collaborating and ensuring the safety of the residents of Incline Village Crystal Bay. Chief Summers goes through the process and recommendations regarding the evacuation process and recommendations for residents during a fire. We are not Paradise. We do not have ground fuels on most of the land. We have a chance to get in there and put the fire out. I do not recommend going to the lake. With fire, comes wind. The lake gets rough, and people sink their boats. Everybody says that everybody is going to evacuate at once. All I can say is that if we ask for just a portion of the town to evacuate, that portion needs to evacuate, and the rest of the people do not need to clog up the roads. You have a point about running out of gas, but you have to take some personal responsibility. Do not be part of the problem. The need for enforcement on Highway 28 to ensure safe evacuation. Let's not forget to put out the fire.

Chair – We keep hearing that Highway 28 parking is going to be enforced.

Answer - They will increase towing and have additional patrols in the summertime to address parking, pedestrian safety, vehicles, bikes, and other related issues. They acknowledged the limited staffing but assured that they are being proactive in addressing the problem. NHP is in charge of this area. They do not have the full staffing capabilities to fully monitor this area.

Caroline Usinger – We need people who are in the know. The fire and police departments need to be involved in these big issues.

Sarah Schmitz – I would encourage an opportunity for a presentation on the plan to the public.

Kristy Wells – I will make sure those educational opportunities come together.

Carole Black – Is there anything we can do to help the resources?

Kathy Jullian – In light of shelter in place, are there going to be barricades in neighborhoods to prevent people from leaving?

Answer – No we generally don’t barricade people into neighborhoods.

Doug Flaherty – I am very proud of Sommers and the fire department, as well as the police. They will do whatever they can to stop the fire. We are not Caldor or Paradise. We are talking about a worst-case scenario. A fire with steam heading into the Tahoe area is something to consider.

Lynn Carol – Interested in raising money to have our own helicopters to prevent major forest fires.

1. **CONTINUATION OF AGENDA ITEM 6 FROM FEBRUARY 6, 2023, MEETING –** Continued discussion on the topic of the IVCB CAB to prepare a presentation to the Washoe County Commissioners.  Kevin Lyons will report to the CAB members and public on the results of a community survey on issues of importance to Incline Village Crystal Bay and recommend the next steps on the presentation.  These discussions will take place throughout the next few months during CAB meetings. **(Possible Action Item).**

Housing and community problems in Incline Village.

A survey went out to citizens of Incline Village and Crystal Bay. The question asked participants to rate their overall impression of Washoe County services, ranging from a lot better to a lot worse since they first arrived. The survey asked people to identify the most important problems in Incline Village and Crystal Bay, allowing them to choose multiple issues. According to the survey, half of the people consider local control and accountability, as well as the availability of housing, to be a very important problem. This indicates that addressing these issues should be a priority for the town. Kevin will put together the next steps with the team at the next meeting. Participants can raise important issues at the next meeting, as neither the public nor the CAB had input on what's most important.

Elise Gall – Is your objective to narrow down the top three issues and try and solve those issues?

Answer from Kevin Lyons – The commissioners do not know what is going on up here, so it is just a way to present the priorities to them.

Christy Wells – 657 out of 9000 homes answered the survey. How does that represent the entire population?

Answer from Kevin Lyons – Statistics. If you have a small group of people that are random, then you will have a good representation within 5-10 percent.

Carole Black – I submitted a suggested way to improve these things. This is one possible way we can set this up to show relative scores. I am not sure we really hit all the items on that flash vote.

Aaron Vanderpool – How did the survey go out?

Answer – It was set up scientifically. There is a panel that people are already signed up for.

1. **PERMIT FEES FOR SHORT-TERM RENTALS –** Kelly Mullin, Washoe County Planning & Building Division Director, will provide an overview on proposed increases to permit fees for short-term rental applications in Washoe County.  **(Non-Action Item)**

The fees that are charged to the STRs should be enough to cover the entire program. The program is currently understaffed. General taxpayer dollars heavily subsidize the operation of the STR program.

Currently, planners and senior planners are managing the program, but the goal is to have planning technicians handle the work to reduce costs and ensure dedicated staff for the program. The program administration includes ensuring safety standards, compliance with other standards related to short-term rentals, all enforcement activities including proactive enforcement, a 24-hour complaint hotline, permitting software for short-term rental permits, and starting in 2023, services provided by Clean Tahoe for STRs in the Tahoe Basin. The specific amounts for the fee changes for SDR permits are yet to be determined and will be released in the next couple of weeks. However, the general range is expected to be between $250 and $350 per permit.

Additionally, there will be new additional fees for work completed on behalf of permit holders outside of the initial permit and renewal process. There are also requests to change the maximum number of occupants, as long as it remains within the tier 1 category of under 10 guests. The county is requesting ongoing input from the public regarding the proposed fee changes, and they plan to present the changes to the Board of County Commissioners in the middle of August.

Diane Becker – How much of the increase is going to enforcement?

Answer - We have a dedicated enforcement officer. I do not think that piece would increase.

Diane Becker – People cannot reach code enforcement in the evenings or on the weekends.

Answer - WC does have a 24-hour hotline for complaints off hours. The complaints are forwarded to the responsible party who is then required to respond.

Jackie Chandler – Sustainable Tahoe is all about accelerating destination stewardship. There has to be onsite hosting. I created the STR model that would work in this area. There has to be a dedicated workforce here.

Jack Dalton – That’s a failed model. It benefits the initial founders of it. The people who own the homes are not from around here. We need to have a lot more regulations. We need more workforce housing.

Margaret Martini – The initial flaw in the short-term rental situation was that Washoe County allowed them in residential zoning, thanks to the decisions made by county commissioners at that time.

Ryan Jurgenson - The speaker believes that a 40 to 60 percent increase in fees is not reasonable and suggests that any increase should be justified by clear help to the community. They also mention concerns about people being priced out of the area.

River Coyote – River has owned a home in the area for 20 years, and expresses the importance of the issue by attending the Citizens Advisory Board meeting for the first time. The speaker mentioned that within six years, they would no longer be able to afford the house they currently live in due to factors such as short-term rentals, the pandemic, and platforms for renting out properties. The speaker is concerned about the possibility of reviewing the financing situation and looking into the allocation of additional fees to ensure they make sense to those receiving the revenues. The speaker expressed support for implementing more fees and caps on short-term rentals in residential areas due to the negative impact they have on neighborhoods, such as creating chaos with trash and parking, burdening infrastructure, and requiring additional time and energy to administer.

Carole Black – The fees that have been proposed seem reasonable. Are they enough to take care of all the additional people that the STRs bring in? There is also the question of where the revenue goes. I believe it goes to pay off bonds. I think the whole financing situation needs to be reviewed. Are there additional fees that need to be considered?

Rhonda Tycer – Most short-term renters are here for the first time. They will be smoking marijuana and drinking. There are a lot of nice people who visit, but there are also jerks. If they are high on alcohol or drugs, they cannot read the rules.

John and Beth Davidson – I would like to support River Coyotes' approach to STRs. There should be a variable rate for people who get STR permits to protect their home equity. The website needs to be improved.

Dana Gaughiur – This government program has grown out of control. We can increase fees, or we can decrease expenses.

Alex Sorci – There is a lot of money, nearly a million dollars, operating this. We should be looking at these expenses.

Pamela Mahoney - They also mentioned that it is unfair for neighbors to subsidize other people's vacation homes, suggesting that if someone cannot afford a second home, they should not buy it.

John Felix – Concerns were raised about the high fees for appealing STRs and the justification for these fees. A short-term rental with an occupancy of 20 people was recently introduced across the street from the speaker's residence. The speaker and their neighbors, who have been long-term residents for 30-plus years, opposed the STR when notified about it last winter. During the meeting, a resident expressed concern about the justification for the $1,200 cost to appeal a decision, stating that they were already paying taxes and it seemed outrageous to have to provide evidence for a short-term rental.

Kathie Julian - The fees are far outweighed by the profit they make.

Julia Bryan – I would support a higher fee if it included increased enforcement.

Doug Flaherty – There should be a 5000 dollar a year fee to support the helicopter we are trying to buy.

Carl Enell – The fee doesn’t cover enforcement. The issue is Wednesday night when the STRs have people in town partying.

Aaron Vanderpool - The speaker expressed their anger towards anyone who supports short-term rentals (STR), stating that they feel like the meeting is a loony bin and want the board to hear their frustration. This just encourages wealth inequality.

1. **E-COMMENT –** Erick Willrich, Assistant to the County Manager, Washoe County, will deliver a brief presentation on E-Comment, which allows citizens to provide public comment electronically on county issues and Board of County Commissioner meeting agenda items.  **(Non-Action Item)**

Comments from Eric Willrich about e-commerce will be postponed until the next meeting.

1. **CAB BOARD MEMBERS ANNOUNCEMENTS –** This item is limited for announcements by CAB members.  **(Non-Action Item)**

There are no announcements.

1. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS MEETING** **MAY 1, 2023****, AND JUNE 5, 2023 (Possible Action Item)**

The approval of the meeting minutes was moved to the next meeting.

1. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT** — Limited to no more than three (3) minutes. Anyone may speak pertaining to any matter either on or off the agenda. Please raise your hand on your computer and then you will be called one by one. Comments are to be addressed to the Board as a whole.

Aaron Vanderpool – Who is going to pay me for all the resources and time that STRs have caused me? Aaron thanks the board members.

Doug Flaherty – The lives and safety are at risk here. These people are not going to stop trying to turn Tahoe into a destination. There is going to be a lawsuit.

Dana Gaughiur – Who closes the loop here? How do we get answers to our questions?

Answer – If you send me a list of these questions, we can get back to you.

1. **ADJOURNMENT**

 Adjourned at 9:05 pm